

Steven E. Rohan Interim Inspector General

OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL CITY OF JACKSONVILLE

AUDIT REPORT No. 2016-AR-0005

ISSUE DATE: DECEMBER 21, 2016

"Enhancing Public Trust in Government"

AUDIT OF CELLPHONE INVENTORY

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Authority

This audit was conducted pursuant to Section 1.203(c), Charter of the City of Jacksonville (City), Section 602.303(a-c), *Ordinance Code*, and the Office of Inspector General's (OIG) Fiscal Year 2016 Audit Plan.

Scope

The OIG conducted an audit of City owned cellphones and other wireless devices as part of the OIG Audit Plan for Fiscal Year 2016, covering the period of June 2015 through June 2016. The audit also included a review of cellphones managed by the Office of the Sheriff, under a separate contract. The purpose of this audit was to determine whether controls were adequate over the issuance, usage, return, billing and invoice payments for City issued cellphones and other wireless devices. (*Note:* other wireless devices include iPads, data usage associated with iPads, data cards, data modems and tabulator modems). During the planning phase of this audit the focus was on understanding the control environment and the overall processes.

The scope of the audit included, but was not limited to:

- Standard Operating Procedures
- Issuance of (new) cellphones and other wireless devices
- Reassigned cellphones and other wireless devices
- Employee Usage
- Inventory Tracking
- Deactivation of wireless services for former employees
- Vendor billing and payment

Objectives

The objectives of the audit were to determine if:

- Adequate policies and procedures are in place generally;
- Adequate controls and processes are in place over the issuance, upgrade and employee usage of cellphones and other wireless devices;
- Adequate controls and processes are in place over the inventory tracking of cellphones;
- Adequate controls and processes are in place for deactivating devices of separating employees in a timely manner;
- Adequate controls and processes are in place for the timely review and reconcilement of vendor billings prior to invoice payment;
- Adequate controls and processes are in place for the reimbursement of unauthorized charges and overages by employees; and
- Adequate controls and processes are in place to ensure that employees with City issued cellphones are not also receiving stipends or technology allowances.

Conclusion

Overall, controls and processes over cellphone and other wireless device inventory appear adequate. Testing indicates that expenditures for cellphone and other wireless services could be reduced by at least 10% through the elimination of under-utilized services, monitoring for inappropriate use of services, the deactivation of accounts assigned to terminated employees, and reducing the number of wireless data cards. Findings were noted and resultant recommendations are presented below.

Findings and Recommendations

Finding 1

The City's review of carrier billing data and subsequent follow up with departments is inadequate to ensure that departments justify costs, overages and under-utilized cellphones and other wireless devices. Based on a review of carrier invoice data retrieved from the Tivoli database, the estimated annual charges associated with excessive costs, overages and under-utilized cellphones and other cellular devices are \$74,811.

Recommendation 1

- a. Information Technologies Division (ITD) should perform additional analytical review of carrier billing data stored in the Tivoli database to detect over or under-utilization of cellphones and other wireless devices. Departments should have responsibility for monitoring employee usage and activity levels.
- b. ITD should require departments to re-evaluate and justify the necessity of each assigned wireless data card. Less expensive alternatives should be considered for the use of wireless data cards with little or no activity, including hotspots, less expensive wireless cards, wireless cards with lower gigabytes, and wireless connectivity services in vehicles. The City should consider the feasibility of equipping City recreational and other facilities that are currently without Wi-Fi connectivity with wireless networks or routers as a part of any capital improvements, in order to reduce the costs associated with the assigned wireless data cards.

Finding 2

There were 204 deactivations of cellular services for Fiscal Year 2016 through the end of June 2016. However, the City continues to be invoiced for cellular services for phones and other devices assigned to individuals who are no longer employed with the City. A comparison of ITD inventory records for cellphones and other wireless devices to reports for current employees and terminated employees obtained from Employee Services indicates that City departments do not always notify ITD or the carriers to discontinue services. The estimated annual charges associated with cellular phones and wireless devices assigned to terminated employees are \$14,850.

Recommendation 2

Departments are responsible for ensuring that separating employees adhere to out-processing protocols established by Employee Services, which include returning any City property in their possession. However, OIG recommends that ITD establish procedures to periodically verify its records with Employee Services records and carrier records, at least annually, to ensure that cellphone inventory is assigned only to current employees and that its records are updated promptly for department reassignment of cellphones and other wireless devices.

Finding 3

Carrier invoices are not paid in a timely manner in accordance with the Florida Prompt Payment Act, §218.73, Florida Statutes.

Recommendation 3

OIG recommends that carrier invoices be reviewed and submitted for payment on a timelier basis. Communication and reconciliation procedures should be improved between ITD and Accounts Payable to ensure that invoices are placed in the que for processing at the point of receipt and all supporting documentation necessary to process payments has been received. If additional time is needed to review invoices for accuracy prior to payment, then Verizon should be contacted to renegotiate the timeframe for payment and the contract should be amended.

Other Matters

Observation 1

Based upon cellphone count records obtained from the Tivoli database, there are 3,245 decommissioned phones. Although ITD considers cellphones the property of the departments to whom the cellphones were issued, the cellphones still need to be properly accounted for as City of Jacksonville property. Going forward, practices and procedures should be established to determine what to do with obsolete and deactivated cellphones and other wireless devices.

Observation 2

Carrier invoice balances are not adequately reviewed to resolve credit balances and billing errors. Credit balances totaling close to \$3,800 remained on six of 23 Sprint accounts for the entire twelve months under review. Accounts with credit balances should be netted against accounts with outstanding balances, or refunds should be requested as soon as possible.

Economic Impact Statement

The total estimated annual cost savings associated with the full implementation of OIG recommendations are estimated to be \$89,661. As a result of the audit, Sprint refunded the City \$3,842.50 for credit balances on six closed Sprint accounts. For this particular audit, the specific economic impacts are as follows:

Alternative Use Funding / Agreed: Potential savings identified that were associated with cellphones or other cellular devices with little or no activity, cost overages or associated with terminated employees which OIG and management agree could be used for alternative use or reappropriation.

\$ 40,811

Alternative Use Funding / Disputed: Potential savings that were associated with cellphones or other cellular devices with little or no activity, cost overages or associated with terminated employees whom OIG believes, and management *disputes* could be used for alternative use or re-appropriation.

\$ 48,800

TABLE OF CONTENTS	
Executive Summary	1
Table of Contents	6
Authority	7
Background	7
Scope, Objectives and Methodology	7
Findings and Recommendations	9
Other Matters	13
Conclusion	13
Management Comments	14
Economic Impact Statement	20

AUTHORITY

This audit was conducted pursuant to Section 1.203(c), Charter of the City of Jacksonville (City), which established the Office of Inspector General (OIG) and its auditing function; Section 602.303(a-c), *Ordinance Code*, which implements the Charter in the City Code; and the OIG's Fiscal Year 2016 Audit Plan.

BACKGROUND

Information Technologies (ITD) oversees the management of cellphones and other wireless devices for City departments, the 4th Judicial Circuit Court Administration, the State Attorney's Office for Duval County and the Public Defender's Office. At the time of the audit there were 1,405 cellphones and 1,220 other wireless devices, in the City's inventory. The three carriers providing services to the City are Verizon, Sprint and AT&T. Verizon provides services for close to 95% of City issued cellphones. In March of Fiscal Year 2015, the City migrated from Sprint to Verizon as the main service provider, under the State of Florida Verizon contract. The City spends approximately \$80,000 monthly for cellphone and other wireless services with the three carriers. However, the migration to the Verizon State of Florida Contract resulted in average monthly cost savings of roughly \$10,000.

The Office of the Sheriff has its own contract with Verizon, which also piggybacks under the State of Florida Contract with Verizon. The Office of the Sheriff has assigned approximately 150 cellphones to staff, exclusive of the cellphones used in under-cover operations. It spends approximately \$66,000 per month with Verizon for all cellular devices.

SCOPE, OBJECTIVES AND METHODOLOGY

The OIG conducted an audit of City owned cellphones and other wireless devices as part of the OIG's Audit Plan for Fiscal Year 2016. The audit also included a review of cellphones managed by the Office of the Sheriff, under a separate contract. The purpose of this audit was to determine that controls are adequate over the issuance, usage, return, billing and invoice payments for City issued cellphones and other wireless devices. (*Note:* other wireless devices include iPads, data usage associated with iPads, data cards, data modems and tabulator modems). During the planning phase of this audit the focus was on understanding the control environment and the overall processes.

The scope of the audit included, but was not limited to:

- Standard Operating Procedures
- Issuance of (new) cellphones and other wireless devices
- Reassigned cellphones and other wireless devices
- Employee Usage
- Inventory Tracking
- Deactivation of cellphones and other wireless services for former employees
- Vendor billing and payment

The period covered by the audit was June 2015 through June 2016.

Objectives

The objectives of the audit were to determine if:

- Adequate policies and procedures are in place, generally;
- Adequate controls and processes are in place over the issuance, upgrade and employee usage of cellphones and other wireless devices;
- Adequate controls and processes are in place over the inventory tracking of cellphones;
- Adequate controls and processes are in place for deactivating devices of separating employees in a timely manner;
- Adequate controls and processes are in place for the timely review and reconcilement of vendor billings prior to invoice payment;
- Adequate controls and processes are in place for the reimbursement of unauthorized charges and overages by employees; and
- Adequate controls and processes are in place to ensure that employees with City issued cellphones are not also receiving stipends or technology allowances.

To accomplish these objectives, interviews were conducted to identify and document the existence of controls over open purchase orders and contracts. Policies, procedures, and other applicable documents were reviewed to further substantiate and identify the existence of certain key controls. OIG also performed substantive tests to determine the effectiveness of key controls.

This audit was conducted in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that the auditor plans and performs the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for findings and conclusions

based on audit objectives. The OIG is satisfied that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for the audit findings and conclusions based on the audit objectives.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding 1

The City's review of carrier billing data and subsequent follow up with departments is inadequate to ensure that departments justify costs, overages and under-utilized cellphones and other wireless devices. Based on our review of carrier invoice data retrieved from the Tivoli database, the estimated annual charges associated with excessive costs, overages and under-utilized cellphones and other wireless devices are \$74,811. OIG notes the following examples below: (Supporting documentation has been provided to the Administration.)

- A Parks and Recreation Maintenance Worker had the second highest total amount invoiced for fiscal year 2016 through May 2016, due to music streaming. The contracted monthly service charge on the account is \$51.50 per month. However, the data use overage charges were in excess of \$200 per month. The employee was not notified of the excessive charges until he was identified during the audit. Although the employee was assigned to an unlimited calling and texting plans, Verizon still may assess fees for data services such as web browsing, daily alerts and downloading of games.
- This audit identified 41 cellphones and 16 wireless devices with little or no activity, for which departments could not justify the continuation of the service. The annualized costs associated with under-utilized cellphones and devices are approximately \$14,167.
- Annualized costs of approximately \$7,340 are associated with five cellphones and four other wireless devices with a high total amount invoiced for the fiscal year through May 2016, for which departments could not adequately justify the total invoiced.
- Our review of a listing of monthly wireless charges not allocated to departments indicated that carriers continued to invoice the City in error for 8 of 27 cellphones that were decommissioned. An additional three cellphones on the listing were not in use and were deactivated during the audit. The estimated annual charges associated with these cellphones are \$4,704.
- Monthly service charges for wireless devices other than phones average \$32,000 per month. This equates to approximately 40% of the total amount invoiced by carriers. Close to \$27,000 of the \$32,000 monthly service charges is for wireless data cards, which permit access to the internet in the absence of Wi-Fi connectivity. OIG estimates that at least 15% of wireless cards assigned to individuals and City offices could be eliminated as more of the City is equipped with wireless networks and routers. This would save the City approximately \$48,800 per year. Our testing revealed \$33,434 in annualized costs

charged to various departments for 75 wireless data cards with little or no usage, which is approximately ten percent of all wireless cards. Of this amount, departments could not provide adequate justification for the continuation of service for 28 cards with associated annualized costs of \$12,049. Thirty-three wireless cards with \$15,276 in annualized costs are assigned to recreational facilities and other buildings without wireless connectivity.

Cellphones and other wireless devices are requested by City departments and purchased with department budgeted funds. ITD policy considers the departments to be the owners of the cellphones and other wireless devices. Additionally, procedures and agreements signed by employees require that cellphones not be used for personal use. However, ITD has the responsibility for review of the details of carrier invoices, since departments only have access to summary information through ITD billing. Eventually, departments will gain access to invoice and usage data related to the phones and devices assigned to their departments through carrier portals. However, ITD maintains costs and usage data downloaded from carrier invoices in the Tivoli database and has a responsibility to perform adequate and timely review of this information. The failure of both departments and ITD to adequately review invoice data would likely result in continued under-utilization and improper use of cellphones and wireless devices, causing the City to incur unnecessary expense.

Recommendation 1

OIG recommends the following:

- a. ITD should perform additional analytical review of carrier billing data stored in the Tivoli database to detect over or under-utilization of cellphones and other wireless devices. Departments should have responsibility for monitoring employee usage and activity levels. All employees should be notified via a policy directive that they may have to repay the City for using data services for web browsing, receiving daily alerts and downloading games or ringtones not covered under the unlimited terms of their plans.
- b. ITD should require departments to re-evaluate and justify the necessity of each assigned wireless data card. Less expensive alternatives should be considered for the use of wireless data cards with little or no activity, including hotspots, less expensive wireless cards, wireless cards with lower gigabytes and wireless connectivity services in vehicles. In order to reduce the costs associated with the assigned wireless data cards, the City should consider the feasibility of equipping City recreational facilities and other buildings that are currently without Wi-Fi connectivity with wireless networks or routers as a part of any capital improvements, in order to reduce the costs associated with the assigned wireless data cards.

Finding 2

There were 204 deactivations of cellular services for fiscal year 2016 through the end of June 2016. However, the City continues to be invoiced for cellular services for phones and other wireless devices assigned to individuals who are no longer employed with the City. A comparison of ITD inventory records for cellphones and other wireless devices to reports for current employees and terminated employees obtained from Employee Services indicates that City departments do not always notify ITD or the carriers to discontinue services. The estimated annual charges associated with cellphones and wireless devices assigned to terminated employees are \$14,850. The following examples are noted: (Supporting documentation has been provided to the Administration.)

- As of the May 2016 carrier billing cycle, the City continued to be billed for at least 34 cellphones assigned to employees who left their City positions. (This equates to approximately 17% of deactivations for fiscal year 2016 through June.) Service was not disconnected or suspended for 29 cellphones and another five cellphones were not reassigned until they were identified during the audit. The estimated annual charges associated with cellphones assigned to terminated employees are \$8,966.
- Eighty four cellphones assigned to terminated employees were updated with the carrier to reflect reassignment to other employees, but the reassignments were not reflected in ITD inventory records.
- The City has been invoiced for at least two cellphones assigned to former employees of the Public Defender's Office and has been invoiced for at least three cellphones assigned to former employees of Court Administration, possibly since 2007. The estimated annual charges associated with cellphones assigned to terminated employees are \$892.
- Twenty-five wireless cards were assigned to terminated employees at the time of the audit. The City continued to be invoiced for five wireless cards that were never reassigned to other employees and for six cards that were not reassigned in a timely manner. The remaining 14 wireless cards were reassigned to current employees, but ITD and the carriers were not notified to update inventory records to reflect the reassignments. The estimated annual charges associated with wireless cards assigned to terminated employees are \$4,992.

Departments are responsible for ensuring that separating employees adhere to outboard protocol established by Employee Services, which includes returning any City property in their possession. ITD standard operating procedures identify Department management as the responsible authority for notifying both ITD and the carriers to terminate, suspend or reassign cellular services. Failure to properly monitor the charges invoiced will continue to result in

payment for unnecessary and under-utilized services. The failure of departments to retrieve phones and other devices from individuals who leave City employment has resulted in unnecessary expense to the City.

Recommendation 2

OIG recommends that ITD establish procedures to periodically verify its records with Employee Services records and carrier records, at least annually, to ensure that cellphone inventory is assigned only to current employees and that its records are updated promptly for department reassignment of cellphones and other wireless devices.

Finding 3

Carrier invoices are not paid in a timely manner in accordance with the Florida Prompt Payment Act, §218.73, Florida Statutes. The following examples are noted: (Supporting documentation has been provided to the Administration.)

- Invoices totaling \$108,433 submitted for payment to Accounts Payable for the months of April, May and June 2016 were not processed for payment until August 2016. ITD staff indicated that the invoices were receipted in JAXPRO in May and June and emailed to Accounts Payable on the same dates. ITD staff should have monitored invoices in FAMIS and JAXPRO until they were paid and should have inquired of Accounts Payable about the unpaid invoices. Provided that all supporting documentation was received, Accounts Payables should have used the dates of the emails as the constructive receipt dates rather than the dates the hardcopies of the invoices were received in the mail or printed out within the department. If additional information was needed in order to process the payment, then ITD staff should have been contacted.
- The Office of the Sheriff did not submit invoices totaling \$402,694 for payment to Accounts Payable for the months of February through July 2015 until August 2015. The Office of the Sheriff did not submit invoices totaling \$214,105 for March 2016 through May 2016 until August 2016. Staff from the Sheriff Office indicated that there were multiple billing errors, which prevented more timely payments. The Florida Prompt Payment Act only permits *the amount associated with the error* to be withheld from a vendor.

The City's Accounts Payable standard operating procedures, in accordance with The Florida Prompt Payment Act, require the City to remit payment to vendors within 45 days of the date of receipt. The City could be obligated to pay interest of one percent monthly on any unpaid balance 30 days after the 45 day period.

Recommendation 3

OIG recommends that carrier invoices be reviewed and submitted for payment on a timelier basis. Communication and reconciliation procedures should be improved between ITD and Accounts Payable to ensure that invoices are placed in the que for processing at the point of receipt and all supporting documentation necessary to process payments has been received. If additional time is needed to review invoices for accuracy prior to payment, then Verizon should be contacted to renegotiate the timeframe for payment.

OTHER MATTERS

Observation 1

Based upon cellphone count records obtained from the Tivoli database, there are 3,245 decommissioned phones. Although ITD considers cellphones the property of the departments to which the cellphones were issued, the cellphones still need to be properly accounted for as City of Jacksonville property. Going forward, practices and procedures should be established to determine what to do with obsolete and deactivated cellphones and other wireless devices.

Observation 2

Carrier invoice balances are not adequately reviewed to resolve credit balances, resolve errors and ensure payment in a timely manner. Credit balances totaling close to \$3,800 remained on six of 23 Sprint accounts for the entire twelve months under review. Accounts with credit balances should be netted against accounts with outstanding balances, or refunds should be requested as soon as possible.

CONCLUSION

Overall, controls and processes over cellphone and other wireless device inventory appear adequate. However, deficiencies were noted over the monitoring of user activity, the termination of services for separating employees and the timely payment of invoices. Testing indicates that expenditures for cellphone and other wireless services could be reduced by approximately 10% through the elimination of under-utilized services, monitoring for inappropriate use of services, the deactivation of accounts assigned to terminated employees, and reducing the number of wireless data cards.

MANAGEMENT RESPONSE

Management's verbatim responses to OIG recommendations are recited below, each followed by OIG's response to the Management Comments:

Management Comments to Recommendation (1a)

ITD will continue to make cost and usage information available monthly through the CBS – the ITD Customer Billing System (sample provided). The billing detail lists the individual charge for each number as well as any overages.

To further assist customer departments and agencies, ITD has implemented the following actions to be fully implemented in Fiscal Year 2017:

- Since October, ITD sends a monthly email notifying departments and agencies each time their ITD Billing invoice is available for review. This web-based invoice provides charge details, inventory updates for devices, and billing contact updates.
- ITD is providing training to departments and agencies on the use of the customer portal provided by the City's main cellular service provider Verizon where the cell phone coordinators in each area can view device and usage charge information directly from the vendor. The first session was held on November 16, 2016, with the final session to be completed by January 31, 2017.

In addition, ITD is making a significant upgrade to the Cell Phone Analytics (internal reporting system) where vendor charges are stored. This upgrade will allow ITD to efficiently audit usage and approve cellular service bills for payment, and will be implemented by December 31, 2016. If discrepancies are identified during this monthly audit, the cell phone coordinator of the customer department (or other responsible party) will be notified for appropriate follow up.

Please be advised that, prior to 2011, employees were required to agree that they would not use their cell phones for personal use. However, according to the City of Jacksonville Comptroller (8/18/2016): "The IRS changed how they treat cell phones and took them off as 'listed property' in 2010 so they are now treated like a regular phone. As long as personal use is *de minimis*, there is no longer a tax issue."

ITD agrees that employees should clearly understand the guidelines for proper use of City cell phones and devices and are revising the existing Electronic Communications Equipment and Media Policy to achieve this. ITD is in the process of developing an electronic policy acknowledgment site to eliminate the need for paper signatures. This is scheduled for completion in April 2017 and ITD will utilize this new, efficient system to publish the updated policy. The revisions will clarify that the policy applies to cell phones and devices and address music streaming, downloading of ringtones, and downloading of games.

OIG's Response to Management Comments on Recommendation (1a)

OIG supports management's response.

Management Comments to Recommendation (1b)

<u>Part 1:</u>

ITD agrees with the recommendation to require departments to reevaluate and justify the necessity of each assigned wireless data card. Justifications for existing cards were requested as part of the audit process. This step will also be incorporated as part of the annual December 2016 ITD Inventory Audit, which is part of the budget preparation process for the FY2018 budget.

Part 2:

ITD does not support the finding that there is a potential savings of \$48,000 per year through the use of alternatives to wireless data cards.

The current in-building devices cost \$36.05 per month (per attached Verizon/State of Florida price list) and are configured to allow City employees unlimited data connectivity and access to the COJ internal network with the use of a login and password. The devices also serve a dual purpose providing public internet access for citizens visiting these facilities.

Alternatives such as installation of dedicated fiber infrastructure to each facility would result in an increased cost of \$289.00 (minimum) per month at each location. See Verizon and AT&T attachments. In addition, to implement Wi-Fi, a facility must first have some type of data connectivity, which comes at an increased reoccurring cost rather than a decrease. It is imperative that ITD provide a solution for City employees that is secure. Given today's elevated security risks associated with ransomware and other vulnerabilities, ITD believes the use of wireless data cards is the most cost effective option, while not compromising on security.

ITD does implement Wi-Fi in buildings as part of a new buildout or renovation. This has occurred in locations such as the Duval County Courthouse, State Attorney building, Public Defenders Office, and most recently City Hall.

OIG's Response to Management Comments on Recommendation (1b)

OIG concurs with part one of the response. However, OIG does not fully concur with part two of the response. Only about one third of the cost savings are associated with data cards used in facilities without Wi-Fi access. The other two thirds of the cost savings are associated with data cards assigned to employees or vehicles that had little or no activity. OIG concedes that alternatives to the use of data cards may be limited in the short run. However, we encourage ITD to consider other alternatives as possible long term solutions.

Management Comments to Recommendation (2)

ITD has added a new step in the electronic separation checklist, (sample provided). The manager filling out the separation checklist will see any cellular devices assigned to the departing employee. If devices are assigned, the supervisor must check a box indicating that they are requesting either:

- Service termination or:
- Re-assignment of the cellular phone or data card to another employee.

Notification of the choice is automatically sent via email to the ITD inventory mailbox for appropriate handling.

ITD has identified a process to address terminations in agencies and entities whose employees do not work for the City of Jacksonville and thus are not covered by the COJ Separation process nor included in the Oracle HRMS database. For these entities, we will request written confirmation that all devices are assigned to active employees as part of the Annual ITD Inventory Audit which is sent out in December. In addition, as part of monthly ITD billing notification emails, all department and agency heads will receive a reminder in March 2017 to verify that their cellular devices are assigned to active employees.

OIG's Response to Management Comments on Recommendation 2

OIG supports management's response.

Management Comments to Recommendation (3)

The Accounts Payable Section of the Accounting Division will process invoices earlier with the following corrective actions:

- 1) The Accounts Payable Supervisor is monitoring work flow on a weekly basis.
- 2) The Accounts Payable Manager and Supervisor have reemphasized to the Account Technicians to up channel, if they get overloaded with invoices during a particular time

- of the month so that resources can be redirected and timely payments can be made.
- 3) The workload has been redistributed due to the filling of three vacant positions and the particular vendor that experienced slow payments has been assigned to a more experienced Account Technician for processing.
- 4) The Accounts Payable Supervisor modified a JaxPro report and sends out to the Account Technicians at least monthly to help identify non payments for POs that have been receipted by the Departments.
- 5) Accounts Payable continues to sample payments made for determining the time it takes to pay and continues to address problem areas and ways to improve the payment process.

Prospectively, the Jacksonville Sheriff's Office follows the Florida Prompt Act, §218.73, Florida Statutes for any disputed invoices. JSO will ensure all undisputed charges are paid in a timely manner and will only withhold payment on disputed charges. The JSO Budget Unit order will be updated to reference the Florida Prompt Payment Act.

OIG's Response to Management Comments on Recommendation 3

OIG supports management's response.

Management Comments to Observation 1

The COJ Surplus process applies to cellphones and other cellular devices. The new procedures for Mobile Service Deactivation or Suspension after Employee Termination include a reminder to utilize the surplus process.

OIG's Response to Management Comments on Observation 1

OIG supports management's response.

Management Comments to Observation 2

All of the Sprint accounts previously having a credit balance at the time of the audit have since been closed. Refund checks, which have been received and deposited, total \$3,842.50.

ITD has enhanced its internal process of telecommunication carrier review by the Network and Telecom Manager to include a secondary review by the IT Billing Administrator of the monthly invoices. In addition, the Network and Telecom Manager will continue to send advance notification to the IT Finance Manager of any expected credits for future or past service. Depending upon the nature of the credit, and the circumstances involved, credits will either be netted against current obligations or refunds requested.

OIG's Response to Management Comments on Observation 2

OIG supports management's response.

ECONOMIC IMPACT STATEMENT

The value to the community and government of any given audit report cannot be measured in dollars and cents alone. System improvements, agency and community awareness, transparency, and prevention are some of the many benefits associated with the audit function.

Nonetheless, the City of Jacksonville's Office of Inspector General believes that the direct economic impact of its audits should be reported to City leaders and the public; and reported in easily understandable terms.

The total estimated annual cost savings associated with the full implementation of OIG recommendations are \$89,611. As a result of the audit, Sprint refunded the City \$3,842.50 for credit balances on six closed Sprint accounts. For this particular audit, the specific economic impacts are as follows:

Alternative Use Funding / Agreed: Potential savings identified that were associated with cellphones or other cellular devices with little or no activity, cost overages or associated with terminated employees which OIG and management agree could be used for alternative use or reappropriation.

\$ 40,811

Alternative Use Funding / Disputed: Potential savings that were associated with cellphones or other cellular devices with little or no activity, cost overages or associated with terminated employees whom OIG believes, and management disputes could be used for alternative use or re-appropriation.

\$ 48.800

Respectfully submitted this 2/day of December 2016:

Steven E. Rohan

Interim Inspector General

Margie McGriff Shannon CPA, CIA

OIG Auditor



OFFICE OF MAYOR LENNY CURRY

ST. JAMES BUILDING 117 W. DUVAL STREET, SUITE 400 JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202 TEL: (904) 630-1776 FAX: (904) 630-2391

www.coj.net

To:

Steve Rohan

Interim Inspector General

From:

Marlene Russell

Director of Organizational Effectiveness

Date:

November 30, 2016

SUBJECT:

Cellphone Inventory Audit

Audit Report No. 2016-AR-0005

Based on the information provided in subject report from the Office of Inspector General below are management comments.

OIG Finding 1:

The City's review of carrier billing data and subsequent follow up with departments is inadequate to ensure that departments justify costs, overages and under-utilized cellphones and other wireless devices. Based on our review of carrier invoice data retrieved from the Tivoli database, the estimated annual charges associated with excessive costs, overages and under-utilized cellphones and other wireless devices are \$74,811. OIG notes the following examples below: (Details have been provided to the Administration.)

- A Parks and Recreation Maintenance Worker had the second highest total amount invoiced
 for fiscal year 2016 through May 2016, due to music streaming. The contracted monthly
 service charge on the account is \$51.50 per month. However, the data use overage charges
 were in excess of \$200 per month. The employee was not notified of the excessive charges
 until they were identified during the audit. Although the employee was assigned to an
 unlimited calling and texting plans, Verizon still may assess fees for data services such as web
 browsing, daily alerts and downloading of games.
- This audit identified 41 cellphones and 16 wireless devices with little or no activity, for which departments could not justify the continuation of the service. The annualized costs associated with under-utilized cellphones and devices are approximately \$14,167.
- Annualized costs of approximately \$7,340 are associated with five cellphones and four other wireless devices with a high total amount invoiced for the fiscal year through May 2016, for which departments could not adequately justify the total invoiced.
- Our review of a listing of monthly wireless charges not allocated to departments indicated that carriers continued to invoice the City in error for 8 of 27 cellphones that were decommissioned. An additional three cellphones on the listing were not in use and were

Office of Inspector General Audit Report No. 2016-AR-0005 Page Two

- deactivated during the audit. The estimated annual charges associated with these cellphones are \$4,704.
- Monthly service charges for wireless devices other than phones average \$32,000 per month. This equates to approximately 40% of the total amount invoiced by carriers. Close to \$27,000 of the \$32,000 monthly service charges is for wireless data cards, which permit access to the internet in the absence of Wi-Fi connectivity. OIG estimates that at least 15% of wireless cards assigned to individuals and City offices could be eliminated as more of the City is equipped with wireless networks and routers. This would save the City approximately \$48,800 per year. Our testing revealed \$33,434 in annualized costs charged to various departments for 75 wireless data cards with little or no usage, which is approximately ten percent of all wireless cards. Of this amount, departments could not provide adequate justification for the continuation of service for 28 cards with associated annualized costs of \$12,049. Thirty-three wireless cards with \$15,276 in annualized costs are assigned to recreational facilities and other buildings without wireless connectivity.

Cellphones and other wireless devices are requested by City departments and purchased with department budgeted funds. ITD policy considers the departments to be the owners of the cellphones and other wireless devices. Additionally, procedures and agreements signed by employees require that cellphones will not be used for personal use. However, ITD has the responsibility for review of the details of carrier invoices, since departments only have access to summary information through ITD billing. Eventually, departments will gain access to invoice and usage data related to the phones and devices assigned to their departments through carrier portals. However, ITD maintains costs and usage data downloaded from carrier invoices in the Tivoli database and has a responsibility to perform adequate and timely review of this information. The failure of both departments and ITD to adequately review invoice data would likely result in continued under-utilization and improper use of cellphone and wireless devices, causing the City to incur unnecessary expense.

OIG Recommendation 1:

OIG recommends the following:

a. ITD should perform additional analytical review of carrier billing data stored in the Tivoli database to detect over or under-utilization of cellphones and other wireless devices. Departments should have responsibility for monitoring employee usage and activity levels. All employees should be notified via a policy directive that they may have to repay the city for using data services for web browsing, receiving daily alerts and downloading games or ringtones not covered under the unlimited terms of their plans.

Office of Inspector General Audit Report. No. 2016-AR-0005 Page Three

b. ITD should require departments to re-evaluate and justify the necessity of each assigned wireless data card. Less expensive alternatives should be considered for the use of wireless data cards with little or no activity, including hotspots, less expensive wireless cards, wireless cards with lower gigabytes and wireless connectivity services in vehicles. In order to reduce the costs associated with the assigned wireless data cards, the City should consider the feasibility of equipping City recreational facilities and other buildings that are currently without Wi-Fi connectivity with wireless networks or routers as a part of any capital improvements, in order to reduce the costs associated with the assigned wireless data cards.

Management Comments to Recommendation (1a):

ITD will continue to make cost and usage information available monthly through the CBS – the ITD Customer Billing System (sample provided). The billing detail lists the individual charge for each number as well as any overages.

To further assist customer departments and agencies, ITD has implemented the following actions to be fully implemented in Fiscal Year 2017:

- Since October ITD sends a monthly email notifying departments and agencies each time their ITD
 Billing invoice is available for review. This web-based invoice provide charge details, inventory
 updates for devices, and billing contact updates.
- ITD is providing training to departments and agencies on the use of the customer portal provided by the City's main cellular service provider Verizon where the cell phone coordinators in each area can view device and usage charge information directly from the vendor. The first session was held on November 16, 2016, with the final session to be completed by January 31, 2017.

In addition, ITD is making a significant upgrade to the Cell Phone Analytics (internal reporting system) where vendor charges are stored. This upgrade will allow ITD to efficiently audit usage and approve cellular service bills for payment and will be implemented by December 31, 2016. If discrepancies are identified during this monthly audit, the cell phone coordinator of the customer department (or other responsible party) will be notified for appropriate follow up.

Please be advised that, prior to 2011, employees were required to agree that they would not use their cell phones for personal use. However, according to the City of Jacksonville Comptroller (8/18/2016): "The IRS changed how they treat cell phones and took them off as 'listed property' in 2010 so they are now treated like a regular phone. As long as personal use is *de minimis*, there is no longer a tax issue."

ITD agrees that employees should clearly understand the guidelines for proper use of City cell phones and devices and are revising the existing Electronic Communications Equipment and Media Policy to achieve this. ITD is in the process of developing an electronic policy acknowledgment site to eliminate the need for paper signatures. This is scheduled for completion in April 2017 and ITD will utilize this new, efficient system to publish the updated policy. The revisions will clarify that the policy applies to cell phones and devices and address music streaming, downloading of ringtones, and downloading of games.

Office of Inspector General Audit Report. No. 2016-AR-0005 Page Four

Management Comments to Recommendation (1b):

Part 1:

ITD agrees with the recommendation to require departments to re-evaluate and justify the necessity of each assigned wireless data card. Justifications for existing cards were requested as part of the audit process. This step will also be incorporated as part of the annual December 2016 ITD Inventory Audit, which is part of the budget preparation process for the FY2018 budget.

Part 2:

ITD does not support the finding that there is a potential savings of \$48,000 per year through the use of alternatives to wireless data cards.

The current in-building devices cost \$36.05 per month (per attached Verizon/State of Florida price list) and are configured to allow city employees unlimited data connectivity and access to the COJ internal network with the use of a login and password. The devices also serve a dual purpose providing public internet access for citizens visiting these facilities.

Alternatives such as installation of dedicated fiber infrastructure to each facility would result in an increased cost of \$289.00 (minimum) per month at each location. See Verizon and AT&T attachments. In addition, to implement Wi-Fi, a facility must first have some type of data connectivity, which comes at an increased reoccurring cost rather than a decrease. It is imperative that ITD provide a solution for City employees that is secure. Given today's elevated security risks associated with ransomware and other vulnerabilities, ITD believes the use of wireless data cards is the most cost effective option, while not compromising on security.

ITD does implement Wi-Fi in buildings as part of a new buildout or renovation. This has occurred in locations such as the Duval County Courthouse, State Attorney building, Public Defenders Office, and most recently City Hall.

OIG Finding 2:

There were 204 deactivations of cellular services for fiscal year 2016 through the end of June 2016. However, the City continues to be invoiced for cellular services for phones and other wireless devices assigned to individuals who are no longer employed with the City. A comparison of ITD inventory records for cellphones and other wireless devices to reports for current employees and terminated employees obtained from Employee Services indicates that City departments do not always notify ITD or the carriers to discontinue services. The estimated annual charges associated with cellphones and wireless devices assigned to terminated employees are \$14,850. The following examples were noted, and details were provided to the Administration:

Office of Inspector General Audit Report. No. 2016-AR-0005 Page Five

- As of the May 2016 carrier billing cycle, the City continued to be billed for at least 34 cellphones assigned to employees who left their City positions. (This equates to approximately 17% of deactivations for fiscal year 2016 through June.) Service was not disconnected or suspended for 29 cellphones and another five cellphones were not reassigned until they were identified during the audit. The estimated annual charges associated with cellphones assigned to terminated employees are \$8,966.
- Eighty four cellphones assigned to terminated employees were updated with the carrier to reflect reassignment to other employees, but the reassignments were not reflected in ITD inventory records.
- The City has been invoiced for at least two cellphones assigned to former employees of the Public Defender's Office and has been invoiced for at least three cellphones assigned to former employees of Court Administration, possibly since 2007. The estimated annual charges associated with cellphones assigned to terminated employees are \$892.
- Twenty-five wireless cards were assigned to terminated employees at the time of the audit. The City continued to be invoiced for five wireless cards that were never reassigned to other employees and for six cards that were not reassigned in a timely manner. The remaining 13 wireless cards were reassigned to current employees, but ITD and the carriers were not notified to update inventory records to reflect the reassignments. The estimated annual charges associated with wireless cards assigned to terminated employees are \$4,992.

Departments are responsible for ensuring that separating employees adhere to outboard protocol established by Employee Services, which includes returning any city property in their possession. ITD standard operating procedures identify Department management as the responsible authority for notifying both ITD and the carriers to terminate, suspend or reassign cellular services. Failure to properly monitor the charges invoiced will continue to result in payment for unnecessary and under-utilized services. The failure of departments to retrieve phones and other devices from individuals who leave city employment has resulted in unnecessary expense to the City.

OIG Recommendation 2:

OIG recommends that ITD periodically verify its records with Employee Services records and carrier records to ensure that cellphone inventory is assigned only to current employees and that its records are updated promptly for department reassignment of cellphones and other wireless devices.

Office of Inspector General Audit Report. No. 2016-AR-0005 Page Six

Management Comments to Recommendation (2):

ITD has added a new step in the electronic separation checklist, (sample provided). The manager filling out the separation checklist will see any cellular devices assigned to the departing employee. If devices are assigned, the supervisor must check a box indicating that they are requesting either:

- Service termination or:
- Re-assignment of the cellular phone or data card to another employee.

Notification of the choice is automatically sent via email to the ITD inventory mailbox for appropriate handling.

ITD has identified a process to address terminations in agencies and entities whose employees do not work for the City of Jacksonville and thus are not covered by the COJ Separation process nor included in the Oracle HRMS database. For these entities, we will request written confirmation that all devices are assigned to active employees as part of the Annual ITD Inventory Audit which is sent out in December. In addition, as part of monthly ITD billing notification emails, all department and agency heads will receive a reminder in March 2017 to verify that their cellular devices are assigned to active employees.

OIG Finding 3:

Carrier invoices are not paid in a timely manner in accordance with the Florida Prompt Payment Act, Section 218.73, Florida Statutes. The following examples were noted, with details provided to the Administration:

Invoices totaling \$108,433 submitted for payment to Accounts Payable for the months of April, May and June 2016 were not processed for payment until August 2016. ITD staff indicated that the invoices were receipted in JAXPRO in May and June and emailed to Accounts Payable on the same dates. ITD staff should have monitored invoices in FAMIS and JAXPRO until they were paid and should have inquired of Accounts Payable about the unpaid invoices. Provided that all supporting documentation was received, Accounts Payables should have used the dates of the emails as the constructive receipt dates rather than the dates the hardcopies of the invoices were received in the mail or printed out within the department. If additional information was needed in order to process the payment, then ITD staff should have been contacted.

The Office of the Sheriff did not submit invoices totaling \$402,694 for payment to Accounts Payable for the months of February through July 2015 until August 2015. The Office of the Sheriff did not submit invoices totaling \$214,105 for March 2016 through May 2016 until August 2016. Staff from the Sheriff Office indicated that there were multiple billing errors, which prevented more timely payments.

Office of Inspector General Audit Report. No. 2016-AR-0005 Page Seven

> The Florida Prompt Payment Act only permits the amount associated with the error to be withheld from a vendor.

The City's Accounts Payable standard operating procedures, in accordance with The Florida Prompt Payment Act, require the City to remit payment to vendors within 45 days of the date of receipt. The City could be obligated to pay interest of one percent monthly on any unpaid balance 30 days after the 45 day period.

OIG Recommendation 3:

OIG recommends that carrier invoices be reviewed and submitted for payment on a timelier basis. Communication and reconciliation procedures should be improved between ITD and Accounts Payable to ensure that invoices are placed in the que for processing at the point of receipt and all supporting documentation necessary to process payments has been received. If additional time is needed to review invoices for accuracy prior to payment, then Verizon should be contacted to renegotiate the timeframe for payment.

Management Comments to Recommendation (3):

The Accounts Payable Section of the Accounting Division will process invoices earlier with the following corrective actions:

- 1) The Accounts Payable Supervisor is monitoring work flow on a weekly basis.
- 2) The Accounts Payable Manager and Supervisor have re-emphasized to the Account Technicians to up channel if they get overloaded with invoices during a particular time of the month so that resources can be redirected and timely payments can be made.
- 3) The workload has been redistributed due to the filling of three vacant positions and the particular vendor that experienced slow payments has been assigned to a more experienced Account Technician for processing.
- 4) The Accounts Payable Supervisor modified a JaxPro report and sends out to the Account Technicians at least monthly to help identify non payments for POs that have been receipted by the Departments.
- 5) Accounts Payable continues to sample payments made for determining the time it takes to pay and continues to address problem areas and ways to improve the payment process.

Prospectively, the Jacksonville Sheriff's Office follows the Florida Prompt Act, Section 218.73; Florida Statutes for any disputed invoices. JSO will ensure all undisputed charges are paid in a timely manner and

Office of Inspector General Audit Report. No. 2016-AR-0005 Page Eight

will only withhold payment on disputed charges. The JSO Budget Unit order will be updated to reference the Florida Prompt Payment Act.

OIG Observation 1:

Based upon cellphone count records obtained from the Tivoli database, there are 3,245 decommissioned phones. Although ITD considers cellphones the property of the departments to which the cellphones were issued, the cellphones still need to be properly accounted for as City of Jacksonville property. Going forward, practices and procedures should be established to determine what to do with obsolete and deactivated cellphones and other wireless devices.

Management Comments Observation 1:

The COJ Surplus process applies to cellphones and other cellular devices. The new procedures for Mobile Service Deactivation or Suspension after Employee Termination include a reminder to utilize the surplus process.

OIG Observation 2:

Carrier invoice balances are not adequately reviewed to resolve credit balances, resolve errors and ensure payment in a timely manner. Credit balances totaling close to \$3,800 remained on six of 23 Sprint accounts for the entire twelve months under review. Accounts with credit balances should be netted against accounts with outstanding balances, or refunds should be requested as soon as possible.

Management Comments Observation 2:

All of the Sprint accounts previously having a credit balance at the time of the audit have since been closed.

Refund checks, which have been received and deposited, total \$3,842.50.

ITD has enhanced its internal process of telecommunication carrier review by the Network and Telecom Manager to include a secondary review by the IT Billing Administrator of the monthly invoices. In addition, the Network and Telecom Manager will continue to send advance notification to the IT Finance Manager of any expected credits for future or past service. Depending upon the nature of the credit, and the circumstances involved, credits will either be netted against current obligations or refunds requested.

The Administration takes the investigation findings listed very seriously and has reviewed each recommended corrective action and responded accordingly.

Office of Inspector General Audit Report. No. 2016-AR-0005 Page Nine

Please let me know if you have any questions.

cc: Lisa Green, Director of Investigations
Sam E. Mousa, P.E., Chief Administrative Officer
Mike Weinstein, Chief Financial Officer
Diane Moser, Acting Director, Employee Services Department
Marsha Oliver, Director, Public Affairs
Bill Clement, Chief of Budget & Management, JSO
Kevin Stork, City Comptroller
Ken Lathrop, Chief Information Officer
File No. 2016-AR-0005

Attachments:

- Attachment 1 Sample ITD Billing cellphone detail
- Attachment 2 Sample Employee Services electronic Separation form showing line item for handling of cell phone or device which was assigned to the terminated employee.
- Attachment 3 a g Updated and New Processes:
 - o Updated: Cellular line of service Move, Add or Change for each of three carriers
 - o New: Cellular line of service for terminated employee –for each of three carriers
 - o Updated: Cellular line of service Monitoring and Oversight
- Attachment 4 AT&T ASE price list
- Attachment 5 Verizon/State of Florida price list showing monthly cost for unlimited data



>

Find | Next





City of Jacksonville

ITD Customer Billing System

Cell Phone Charges For October 2016

ERAC011 - ANIMAL CARE AND CONTROL

4		
Character		
Additional •		
Additional		
4		
2		
4		
Sec		
4		
Veador		
Accioned In •		
4 80		

Total ¢ Charge	
Used : Mins Chg	
Chargeable Used Mins	
Additional Character Data Character	
Additional Text Chg	
Misc +	
Base Chg	
Vendor \$	
Assigned To \$	
Station +	
Index Code 💠	

					35	
ERAC011	9042	Verizon	\$37.74		726	\$37.74
ERAC011	9042	Verizon	\$16.80		319	\$16.80
ERAC011	9042:	Verizon	\$44.92		378	\$44.92
ERAC011	904	Verizon	538.70		39	\$38.70
ERAC011	904	Verizon	\$15.62	\$0.53	767	\$16.15
ERAC011	9045	Verizon	\$15.41		294	\$15.41
ERAC011	9045	Verizon	\$36.48			\$36.48
ERAC011	9045	Verizon	(\$6.75)			(\$6.75)
ERAC011	904	Verizon	\$0.22			\$0.22
ERAC011	904	Verizon	\$52.23		112	\$52.23
ERAC011	9048	Verizon	\$25.48	\$0.26	285	\$25.74
ERAC011	9048	Verizon	\$12.47		237	\$12.47
ERAC011	904	Verizon	\$6.35		118	\$6.35
ERAC011	504	Verizon	\$27.52		526	\$27.52
ERAC011	904	Verizon	\$37.22		14	\$37.22
ERAC011	505	Verizon	(\$6.75)			(\$6.75)
ERAC011	904	Verizon	57.62		143	\$7.62
ERAC011	904	Verizon	\$5.95		111	\$5.95
ERAC011	904	Verizon	\$39.30		53	\$39.30
ERAC011	06	Verizon	\$35.81	\$0.02	484	\$35.83
Total Devices: 20			\$442.34	\$0.81	4,136	\$443.15

Page 1 of 1



EIN		BOY-NA AND ORDER AND			
Employee	Name:	W	ork Phone:		
-					
Employee	Job Title:	D	iv. /Dept. Nam	e:	
Supervisor	's Name:		upv. or Dept. hone:		
Organizatio	оп:	Le	ast Day Worke	d:	
Separation	Date:				
Check Mark	U	pon notification of separation the fol	on: Div. Reps a lowing action		ust complete
	Meet w	ith employee to secure sign	natures if requir	ed	
		Employee Services with horeks of employment. ents:	urs of leave ta	ken and hours v	vorked in the last
		or upload the resignation le ance by supervisor/division here:			
	Optionhome a	employee to contact Emplo is available, COBRA & HIPA iddress) ellation of Bailey's membersi	A Certification	s (certification v	
	Verify c Address	urrent address or forwarding Line 1 : Line 2 :			
	service t Re-assig	yee was issued a cellular pho ermination or name re-assigr ned to: N/A if service termination re	nment from you	r Cell Phone Cod	rdinator.
			<u>item</u> <u>Issued?</u> <u>Yes/No</u>	Item returned or still owed?	Estimated Value if owed
	identific	the City issued employee ation badge	No	Owed	
	Obtain	City issued uniforms	No	Owed	1 Address - 1-18 P - Address - 118 B - Address - 118 Addre
	Obtain	City issued keys and credit	No	Owed	

Attachment 2

Number: Comments on this Item (Optional):		Obtain City	/ issued pager		No	Owed		
verification is not provided, then the division representative and/or supervisor will be held responsible for missing equipment. Failure on the division representative's or supervisor's part to provide the information in a timely manner will delay the employee's terminal leave payment. If Employee supervises subordinates, please include name of new supervisor: Asset Type: Asset Class: Manufacturer: Model/Unit Number: Returned: Number: Comments on this Item (Optional):		Overpaym	ent of salary, of	her pays	No	Owed		
Asset Type: Asset Class: Manufacturer: Model/Unit Serial Number: Returned: Number: Comments on this Item (Optional):		verification be held res or superviso employee'	is not provided ponsible for mis or's part to prov s terminal leave	, then the sing equi ide the in paymer	e division pment. Iformationt.	representativ Failure on the n in a timely r	e and/or division re nanner w	supervisor will epresentative's ill delay the
The state of the s		ii Employee	e supervises sub	ordinates	s, piease	include riame	e or new s	upervisor:
	Asset Type:	Asset Class:	Manufacturer:			Serial Numb	er:	Returned:
	Additional I	T Assets (Not	Listed Above):					
	C-11-1-		poor.	`-l	vno.			
Schedule Device Pick Un From IT? * Select or type	Schedule L	levice Pick II	ln From IT? * 🗟	select or t	γρε			
Schedule Device Pick Up From IT? * Select or type (Note: If device pick up is not scheduled, ownership of the former employee's devices is trait their manager)	(Note: If de	evice pick up				the former	employee	's devices is tra
(Note: If device pick up is not scheduled, ownership of the former employee's devices is train	(Note: If de their mana Supervisor	evice pick up ger) Sign Off:		ed, owne	ership of		employee	's devices is tra





AT&T Mobile Device Move, Add and Change

This process details the steps for move, add and change request for AT&T mobile device services.

Moves, Changes and Spare Activations

Submit an ITD Service Request to have ITD request the change.

For New Service(s) (cell, smartphone, tablets, data devices, Mi-Fi, etc.):

- 1. Submit a request to ITD for a device and service quote to include:
 - Transfer directive with the Business Case noted on the TD
 - Requested device and type of service
 - Name associated with the number: Employee Name or Device Name
 - Index Code Description from FAMIS, i.e. Mowing and Landscaping
 - Delivery to: Department
 - Attention To: "Department Cell Phone Coordinator"
 - Address

Plan: (Provided in the quote from AT&T)

- 2. ITD will work with AT&T and AT&T will send a request to ITD to "Approve" the request for new services.
- 3. ITD will approve the request and monitor the FAMIS for the TD and follow-up with the customer if needed on the TD request.
- 4. ITD will transfer the ticket to Inventory for the device to be updated in Tivoli.

AT&T Contact for Quotes, Plan and Device Questions:

- Chris Wadley Cw3669@att.com 407-320-3120
- Xiomara Spring xr7991@att.com 861-319-9540
- Brooke Walker bw039c@att.com





Sprint Mobile Device Move, Add and Change

This process details the steps for move, add and change request for SPRINT mobile device services.

Moves, Changes and Spare Activations

Submit an ITD Service Request to have ITD request the change.

For New Service(s) (cell, smartphone, tablets, data devices, Mi-Fi, etc.):

- 1. Submit a request to ITD for a device and service quote to include:
 - Transfer directive with the Business Case noted on the TD
 - Requested device and type of service
 - Name associated with the number: Employee Name or Device Name
 - Index Code Description from FAMIS, i.e. Mowing and Landscaping
 - Delivery to: Department
 - Attention To: "Department Cell Phone Coordinator"
 - Address

Plan: (Provided in the quote from SPRINT)

- 2. ITD will work with SPRINT and SPRINT will send a request to ITD to "Approve" the request for new services.
- 3. ITD will approve the request and monitor the FAMIS for the TD and follow-up with the customer if needed on the TD request.
- ITD will transfer the ticket to Inventory for the device to be updated in Tivoli.

Sprint Contacts for Quotes, Plan and Device Questions:

- Jan Weiss jan.j.weiss@sprint.com 407-320-3120
- Sprint Support sprintsupport6@sprint.com





Verizon Mobile Device Move, Add and Change

This process details the steps for move, add and change request for Verizon mobile device services.

Moves, Changes and Spare Activations

- Primary Login to the Verizon portal to make name changes and cost center (department) changes.
- Secondary Send a request to Verizon at the contacts below with a request for the name and or cost center (department) change(s).
- Back-up Submit an ITD Service Request to have ITD request or make the name and or cost center (department) change(s).

Verizon Contacts:

- Kyla Glover floridabussinesssupportgovtaccounts@HQ.Verizonwireless.com
- Tom Beck thomas.beck@verizonwireless.com Mobile 904-716-2600
- Paul Tuccelli <u>Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com</u> Mobile 904-252-8902

Contact Verizon for Quotes, Plan and Device Questions:

- Kyla Glover floridabussinesssupportgovtaccounts@HQ.Verizonwireless.com
- Tom Beck thomas.beck@verizonwireless.com Mobile 904-716-2600
- Paul Tuccelli Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com Mobile 904-252-8902

For New Service(s) (Cell/Smartphone/Tablets/Data Cards/Mi-Fi, etc.):

- 1. Contact for a device and new service quote.
 - Thomas.Beck@VerizonWireless.com and cc: Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com.
 (The quote is based on ITD recommendations and the Verizon State of Florida Contract. The requesting Department is responsible for purchasing the device(s) and accessories directly through Verizon.)
- 2. Contact the ITD Service Desk with a Request for new service and attach a copy of:
 - The quote
 - TD to the Service Desk ticket with a Business Case noted on the TD.

Then

- 3. Contact Verizon at: Thomas.Beck@VerizonWireless.com and cc: Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com with your request for new cell phone service.
 - Example email request language:
 - Total New Number(s): 1
 - Device Upgrade: NO
 - Device Type and Basic Model Name: Smartphone, Motorola Razr Maxx
 - Cost Center: Index Code <u>Description</u> from FAMIS, i.e. Mowing and Landscaping





Delivery to: Department

Floor

Attention To: "Department Cell Phone Coordinator"

Address

Name associated with the number: Employee Name

Plan: (Provided in the quote from Verizon)

4. Verizon will send a request to ITD to "Approve" the request for new services.

- 5. ITD will approve the request and monitor the FAMIS for the TD and follow-up with the customer if needed on the TD request.
- 6. ITD will transfer the ticket to Inventory for the update in Tivoli.

For a Spare/Upgrade Device(s):

- 1. Contact Verizon for a device and new service quote.
 - Thomas.Beck@VerizonWireless.com and cc: Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com. (The
 quote is based on ITD recommendations and the Verizon State of Florida Contract. The
 requesting Department is responsible for purchasing the device(s) and accessories
 directly through Verizon.)
- 2. Contact the ITD Service Desk with a Request for new service and attach a copy of:
 - The quote
 - TD to the Service Desk ticket with a Business Case noted on the TD.

Then

- Contact Verizon: Thomas.Beck@VerizonWireless.com and cc: Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com with your request for new cell phone service.
 - Example Request Language:
 - Total New Number(s): 1
 - Device Upgrade: NO
 - Device Type and Basic Model Name: Smartphone, Motorola Razr Maxx
 - Cost Center: Index Code <u>Description</u> from FAMIS, i.e. Mowing and Landscaping
 - Delivery to: Department

Floor

Attention To: "Department Cell Phone Coordinator"

Address

- Name associated with the number: (Spare Phone Name)
- Plan: (Provided in the quote from Verizon)
- 4. Verizon will send a request to ITD to "Approve" the request for new services.
- 5. ITD will approve the request and monitor the FAMIS for the TD and follow-up with the customer if needed on the TD request.
- 6. ITD will transfer the ticket to Inventory for the update in Tivoli.
- 7. When the device is delivered it can be used as a spare immediately or shelved for later. Contact Verizon: Kyla Glover -

floridabussinesssupportgovtaccounts@HQ.Verizonwireless.com





Thomas.Beck@VerizonWireless.com and cc: Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com with a request to move the new device to the old number that needs the device. If the device is not active with a number it can be changed on the portal.

8. The new number the device was issued with <u>must</u> stay active for a minimum of 30 days, after which the number can be deactivated*. In other words, the requesting department will have to pay for at least 1 month of service on the new line. Contact Verizon:

Thomas.Beck@VerizonWireless.com and cc: Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com to deactivate the number after the first 30 days. **NOTE**: If the number is deactivated before the 30 day window, the **full price** of the device will be charged to the department and the line of service will continue billing even if the phone is not being used.

Switching from a Flip to Smartphone (except for the TD, the process is similar to a spare):

- 1. Follow the steps above to obtain a "Spare" smartphone to use for the upgrade on the flip phone.
- Contact Verizon: Thomas.Beck@VerizonWireless.com and cc:
 Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com for a new data service quote. Notify them you would like to upgrade the flip phone to a smartphone and need a quote for the additional "data" services (the flip phone is already in the budget) for the remainder of the FY. They will use pricing based on ITD recommendation and the Verizon State of Florida Contract.
- 3. Contact the ITD Service Desk with the Request to upgrade from a flip to smartphone with new data service and attach a copy of the quote and copy of the TD for the new data service.
- 4. Contact Verizon: Thomas.Beck@VerizonWireless.com and cc: Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com with your request for new cell data service.
- 5. Verizon will send a request to ITD for approval of the new data service.
- 6. ITD will approve the request and monitor the FAMIS for the TD and follow-up with the customer if needed on the TD request.
- Contact Verizon: Thomas.Beck@VerizonWireless.com and cc: Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com with a request to move the "spare" smartphone to the old number that needs the upgrade device.

8.

Example Devices and Plans (subject to change)*:

- Flip Phone Approved model is the Galaxy Samsung Convoy 3*
 - 1. \$.049 Per Minute Nationwide Voice Plan-includes 600 M2M and 600 N&W. Unlimited Texting can be added at \$7.00 per month.
 - 2. \$10.00 Unlimited PTT w/ Unlimited Mobile 2 Mobile \$.049 per min rate out of network (Non-Verizon call). Unlimited Texting can be added at \$7.00 per month.
 - 3. Unlimited Florida Calling w/ Unlimited PTT & \$.103 Per Minute Domestic Roam at \$41.20 per month. Unlimited Texting can be added at 7.00 per month.
- Smartphone

Approved models:

o Galaxy S5*, iPhone 5S/6/6 Plus, Motorola Droid Turbo





Approved Smartphone Plans:

- \$51.00 Smartphone (86769)- Unlimited Nationwide Calling, Unlimited Domestic Text/Pix/Flix Messaging; Email and Data, 5GB of Hotspot. Push to Talk can be added for \$5.00 per month.
- \$35.99 Smartphone Standalone Nationwide Per Minute (93445) -Unlimited Nationwide Smartphone Data, Unlimited HotSpot, Unlimited Domestic Text/ Pix, Flix Messaging, Verizon to Verizon / Unlimited Mobile 2 Mobile, Unlimited Nights/Weekends & \$.052 Per Minute Nationwide Voice Plan. Push to Talk can be added for \$5.00 per month.
- *FFM Field Force Manager (AVL): Flip or Smartphone available on Samsung Convoy 3,
 Samsung Galaxy S4 and S5 only.
 - Limited=\$15.00, Basic=\$20.00 (has Timesheet login feature) and Pro=\$25.00
 - For more information on plan features: http://business.verizonwireless.com/content/b2b/en/solutions/technology/mobile-workforce-management/field-force-manager.html

There is a 30 day return policy for all services, devices and accessories purchased through Verizon.

Due to the rapid changes in devices and plans offered on the Verizon State Contract, contact Verizon for questions related to devices and plans.

- Tom Beck (Primary) thomas.beck@verizonwireless.com Mobile 904-716-2600
- Paul Tuccelli (cc:)- Paul.Tuccelli@VerizonWireless.com Mobile 904-252-8902

Below are some acronyms and definitions COJ and/or Verizon may use:

FFM = Field Force Manager

M2M = Mobile to Mobile

N&W = Nights & Weekends

PTT = Push-To-Talk

Cost Center = Verizon's equivalent to our city Account Number Description and/or Index Code Description

TD = Transfer Directive (or your Department's method for transferring money for the additional service(s)). Completed for the remainder of the current FY go to ITD's Index Code: OPIT531CS, Sub object 04105.

Business Case = Document explaining the need for the additional mobile device(s). See sample below.

Mi-Fi = Mobile Hot Spot Device (Must be connected to the COJ private network)
Data Device = All other cellular data devices, i.e. PCMCIA, USB, etc.





Procedure – AT&T Mobile Service Deactivation or Suspension after Employee Termination

Employee Termination – Mobile Device Service Deactivation or Suspension

This process details the steps to take for an employee's AT&T mobile device and line of service after they are no longer employed by the City of Jacksonville.

- The Supervisor or Manager fills out the Employee Services Out Processing form (located on the COJ Employee Web Portal) "checking" the appropriate box that they have received the mobile device and will either deactivate or suspend the line of service for the device.
 - a. For **Deactivation** the Supervisor, Manager or designee will use the following method as a way to deactivate the line of service:
 - Submit a Service Desk ticket to deactivate the line of service.
 - 1. ITD will request the deactivation
 - 2. ITD will transfer the ticket to Inventory to update Tivoli.
 - b. For **Suspension** the Supervisor, Manager or designee will use the following method as a way to suspend the line of service for 90 days*:
 - Submit a Service Desk ticket to deactivate the line of service.
 - 1. ITD will request the suspension.
 - 2. ITD will transfer the ticket to Inventory to update Tivoli.
- 2. Through the Service Desk ticket request the Cell Phone Coordinator will work with ITD to confirm the line of service has been suspended or deactivated.
 - a. To assist with the prompt appropriate action for the lines of service for terminated employees ITD will:
 - Send out weekly notifications to the Cell Phone Coordinators by Department of terminated employees requesting the line(s) be deactivated of suspended.
 - ii. ITD will send out monthly "zero" usage reports to departments requesting the lines be deactivated or suspended.
- 3. The Cell Phone Coordinator for the department will store the device in the associated department's inventory to be reissued or surplused**.

^{*}The device will need to be deactivated after the 90 day suspension period if it has not been reissued.

^{**}Use the normal City of Jacksonville surplus process.





Procedure – SPRINT Mobile Service Deactivation or Suspension after Employee Termination

Employee Termination – Mobile Device Service Deactivation or Suspension

This process details the steps to take for an employee's SPRINT mobile device and line of service after they are no longer employed by the City of Jacksonville.

- The Supervisor or Manager fills out the Employee Services Out Processing form (located on the COJ Employee Web Portal) "checking" the appropriate box that they have received the mobile device and will either deactivate or suspend the line of service for the device.
 - a. For **Deactivation** the Supervisor, Manager or designee will use the following method as a way to deactivate the line of service:
 - Submit a Service Desk ticket to deactivate the line of service.
 - 1. ITD will request the deactivation
 - 2. ITD will transfer the ticket to Inventory to update Tivoli.
 - b. For Suspension the Supervisor, Manager or designee will use the following method as a way to suspend the line of service for 90 days*:
 - Submit a Service Desk ticket to deactivate the line of service.
 - 1. ITD will request the suspension.
 - 2. ITD will transfer the ticket to Inventory to update Tivoli.
- 2. Through the Service Desk ticket request the Cell Phone Coordinator will work with ITD to confirm the line of service has been suspended or deactivated.
 - a. To assist with the prompt appropriate action for the lines of service for terminated employees ITD will:
 - Send out weekly notifications to the Cell Phone Coordinators by Department of terminated employees requesting the line(s) be deactivated of suspended.
 - ii. ITD will send out monthly "zero" usage reports to departments requesting the lines be deactivated or suspended.
- 3. The Cell Phone Coordinator for the department will store the device in the associated department's inventory to be reissued or surplused**.

^{*}The device will need to be deactivated after the 90 day suspension period if it has not been reissued.

^{**}Use the normal City of Jacksonville surplus process.





Procedure – Verizon Mobile Service Deactivation or Suspension after Employee Termination

Employee Termination - Mobile Device Service Deactivation or Suspension

This process details the steps to take for an employee's Verizon mobile device and line of service after they are no longer employed by the City of Jacksonville.

- The Supervisor or Manager fills out the Employee Services Out Processing form (located on the COJ Employee Web Portal) "checking" the appropriate box that they have received the mobile device and will either deactivate or suspend the line of service for the device.
 - a. For **Deactivation*** the Supervisor, Manager or designee will use the following methods as a way to deactivate the line of service:
 - <u>Primary</u> Send an email to Verizon
 (floridabussinesssupportgovtaccounts@HQ.Verizonwireless.com)
 requesting deactivation of the line.
 - Secondary Submit a Service Desk ticket to deactivate the line of service.
 - b. For Suspension* the Supervisor, Manager or designee will use the following methods as a way to suspend the line of service for 90 days**:
 - Primary Log into the Verizon web portal and <u>change the name</u> and suspend (with no billing) the line of service.
 - <u>Secondary</u> Send an email to Verizon
 (<u>floridabussinesssupportgovtaccounts@HQ.Verizonwireless.com</u>)
 requesting a <u>name change</u> and suspension (with no billing) of the line of service.
 - <u>Back-Up</u>- Submit a Service Desk ticket to change the name and suspend (with no billing) the line of service.
- 2. Through the portal or communication with ITD the Cell Phone Coordinator for the department will confirm the line of service has been suspended or deactivated.
 - a. To assist with the prompt appropriate action for the lines of service for terminated employees ITD will:
 - Send out weekly notifications to the Cell Phone Coordinators by Department of terminated employees requesting the line(s) be deactivated of suspended.
 - ii. ITD will send out monthly "zero" usage reports to departments requesting the lines be deactivated or suspended.
- 3. The Cell Phone Coordinator for the department will store the device in the associated department's inventory to be reissued or surplused***.





Procedure – Verizon Mobile Service Deactivation or Suspension after Employee Termination

- *ITD will receive a notification of the deactivation on the weekly inventory report provided by Verizon and will update the inventory accordingly.
- **The device will need to be deactivated after the 90 day suspension period if it has not been reissued.
- ***Use the normal City of Jacksonville surplus process.





Procedure – Mobile Lines of Service Monitoring and Oversight

Monitoring and Oversight of all mobile lines of service for all the carriers.

This process details the steps ITD will take to ensure the accuracy and necessity of the mobile lines of service currently being charged to the City of Jacksonville.

- 1. The ITD Network and Telecom Infrastructure Manager will have monthly bill review (MBR) meetings with each vendor providing services to the City of Jacksonville. The carriers or vendor will provide the MBR document with recommendations for plan changes, usage, zero usage, etc. ITD will make changes as needed and provide this same information to departments and request appropriate changes to the lines of service. i.e. deactivate, suspend, etc.
 - a. In addition the ITD Business Intelligence (BI) team will provide an analytics website to assist with auditing the number of lines, usage, zero usage, etc.. This will help the ITD Network and Telecom Infrastructure Managers review ensuring the carrier charges reflect the accurate needs of the business.
 - b. In addition the customers can see their current mobile device details and charges on the ITD Customer Billing Solution (CBS) website.
- In parallel with the Network and Telecom Infrastructure Manager's review of monthly vendor bills, the ITD Billing Administrator will conduct a secondary audit of these charges.
- 3. The carrier with the largest amount of lines of service will provide a quarterly report detailing all lines of service, plans, costs, usage, etc. From this report the carrier will provide recommendations to reduce costs based on usage and any contract plan changes. ITD will analyze the recommendations and working with the departments make appropriate changes. The quarterly reports may be superseded by the monthly reports.



AT&T's Response to City of Jacksonville's RFP for Data Services

BID PROPOSAL FORM ATTACHMENT A

SECTION 1

Item	Description	Total Monthly Rate All Site Locations (Based on 36 Month Contract)	Total Yearly Rate All Site Locations (Based on 36 Month Contract)	Total Cost for 36 Month Contract All Site Locations	
Optio	n A				
1	High-Speed Bandwidth Metropolitan Ethernet		70		
	10 Mbps –Fixed Rate at each of the site locations and 500 Mpbs Head-End Circuits (2 head End Locations)	\$24,013.00	\$288,156.00	\$864,468.00	
Optio	n B				
2	High-Speed Bandwidth Metropolitan Ethernet				
Ø.	20 Mbps –Fixed Rate at each of the site locations and 1000 Mpbs Head- End Circuits (2 head End Locations)	\$29,465.50	\$353,586.00	\$1,060,758.00	

Pricing shall be inclusive of all applicable charges; including but not limited to, provisioning, connection, construction charges, labor, tariff, taxes (local, federal, state), site visits, program management, etc.

REMAINDER OF PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK





AT&T's Response to City of Jacksonville's RFP for Data Services

BID PROPOSAL FORM ATTACHMENT A

SECTION 2

Item	Catalog Pricing	Unit Price Per Site Location Per Month	Extended Price Per Site Location Per Year
1	High-Speed Bandwidth Metropolitan Ethernet 2 Mbps – Fixed Rate	\$289.00	\$3,468.00
2	High-Speed Bandwidth Metropolilan Ethernet 5 Mb p s –Fixed Rate	\$346.00	\$4,152.00
3	High-Speed Bandwidth Metropolitan Ethernet 10 Mbps –Fixed Rate	\$425.00	\$5,100.00
4	High-Speed Bandwidth Metropolitan Ethernet 20 Mbps –Fixed Rate	\$521.50	\$6,258.00
5	High-Speed Bandwidth Metropolitan Ethernet 50 Mb p s –Fixed Rate	\$570.50	\$6,846.00
6	High-Speed Bandwidth Metropolitan Ethernet 100 Mb p s –Fixed Rate	\$631.00	\$7,572.00
7	High-Speed Bandwidth Metropolitan Ethernet 500 Mb p s –Fixed Rate	\$744.00	\$8,928.00
8	High-Speed Bandwidth Metropolitan Ethernet 500 Mbps –Head-end	\$744.00	\$8,928.00
9	1000 Mbps/1 Gbps - Fixed Rate	\$913.00	\$10,956.00
10	1000 Mbps/1 Gbps Head-end	\$913.00	\$10,956.00

Pricing shall be inclusive of all applicable charges; including but not limited to provisioning, connection, construction charges, labor, tariff, taxes (local, federal, state), site visits, program management, etc.

In the event of a site location cancellation the Catalog Pricing listed for the particular service type, provided within this Proposal Form, will be deducted from the total monthly service fee.

In the event a new site location is added the Catalog Pricing listed for the particular service type, provided within the this Proposal Form, will be added to the monthly service fee and will become part of the original Contract Terms.



verizon State of Florida Pricing/1011-008C

Basic Phones

- 1. \$0.00 Per month Nationwide Per Minute (86680) \$0.049 Per Minute Nationwide Voice Plan with 600 Verizon to Verizon Minutes IE Mobile to Mobile/ 600 Nights & Weekend Minutes & 200 Text, Pix & Flix messaging.
- \$10.00 Nationwide Per Minute (86678)
 \$0.049 Per Minute Nationwide Voice Plan with Unlimited Push to Talk & Verizon to Verizon / Unlimited Mobile 2 Mobile.
- \$20.60 Florida (86192)
 250 Anytime Minutes (\$.052 per min overage rate) also included, Verizon to Verizon / Unlimited Mobile 2 Mobile, Unlimited Push 2 Talk & Unlimited Nights & Weekends.
- 4. 30.90 Florida (86193)
 600 Anytime Min (\$.052 per min overage rate) also included, Verizon to Verizon /
 Unlimited Mobile 2 Mobile, Unlimited Push 2 Talk & Unlimited Nights & Weekends.
- 5. \$41.20 Florida (86194)
 Unlimited Talk & Unlimited Push to Talk
- \$25.75 Nationwide (86195)
 Nationwide 250 Anytime Minutes (\$.052 per min overage rate) also included, Verizon to Verizon / Unlimited Mobile 2 Mobile, Unlimited Push 2 Talk & Unlimited Nights & Weekends.
- 7. \$36.05 Nationwide (86196)
 Nationwide 600 Anytime Min (\$.052 per min overage rate) also included, Verizon to Verizon / Unlimited Mobile 2 Mobile, Unlimited Push 2 Talk & Unlimited Nights & Weekends.
- 8. \$51.50 Nationwide (86197)
 Unlimited Talk & Unlimited Push to Talk.



Smart Phones

- \$35.99 Smartphone Standalone Nationwide Per Minute (93445)
 Unlimited Nationwide Smartphone Data, Unlimited HotSpot, Unlimited Domestic Text.
 Pix, Flix Messaging, Verizon to Verizon / Unlimited Mobile 2 Mobile, Unlimited
 Nights/Weekends & \$.052 Per Minute Nationwide Voice Plan. Push to Talk can be added for \$5.00
- 2. \$51.00 Smartphone (86769)
 Unlimited Nationwide Calling, Unlimited Domestic Text/Pix/Flix Messaging;
 Email and Data, Hotspot. Push to Talk can be added for \$5.00

Data Modems

- 1. \$36.05 Unlimited Data
- 2. \$0.00 per month/Pay per MB \$0.099

3.

87644	150MB Machine to Machine Share (\$1.00 per MB overage rate) Tier 1	\$18.00
87645	250MB Machine to Machine Share (\$.02 per MB overage rate) Tier 2	\$20.00
87646	1GB Machine to Machine Share (\$.02 per MB overage rate) Tier 2	\$25.00
87647	5GB Machine to Machine Share (\$.02 per MB overage rate) Tier 2	\$50.00
87648	10GB Machine to Machine Share (\$.02 per MB overage rate) Tier 2	\$80.00